



## Early Journal Content on JSTOR, Free to Anyone in the World

This article is one of nearly 500,000 scholarly works digitized and made freely available to everyone in the world by JSTOR.

Known as the Early Journal Content, this set of works include research articles, news, letters, and other writings published in more than 200 of the oldest leading academic journals. The works date from the mid-seventeenth to the early twentieth centuries.

We encourage people to read and share the Early Journal Content openly and to tell others that this resource exists. People may post this content online or redistribute in any way for non-commercial purposes.

Read more about Early Journal Content at <http://about.jstor.org/participate-jstor/individuals/early-journal-content>.

JSTOR is a digital library of academic journals, books, and primary source objects. JSTOR helps people discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content through a powerful research and teaching platform, and preserves this content for future generations. JSTOR is part of ITHAKA, a not-for-profit organization that also includes Ithaka S+R and Portico. For more information about JSTOR, please contact [support@jstor.org](mailto:support@jstor.org).

# THE CLASSICAL WEEKLY

Entered as second-class matter November 18, 1907, at the Post Office, New York, N. Y., under the Act of Congress of March 1, 1879

VOL. VIII

NEW YORK, APRIL 24, 1915

No. 24

## III. Discussion of the Several Grounds of Complaint:

15 A, A rebus . . . abstrahit,—84.

A. Discussion of the First Complaint, that senectus advocat a rebus gerendis: 15 A—26.

(1) This complaint is disproved by the careers of certain old men—Fabius, Paulus, Fabricius, Curius, Coruncanus, Appius Claudius: 15 A—16<sup>6</sup>.

(2) It is disproved also by a consideration of the qualities necessary to the accomplishment of great things. These qualities are (a) *consilium*, (b) *auctoritas*, (c) *sententia*, i.e. mental qualities, the very qualities possessed by old men: 17–20.

(3) Apparent Digression.

To this point the movement of the thought has been most orderly. 21–22 afford a good example of *occupatio* (note *at*, for which compare 33, 35, 47, 65). These sections forestall a possible objection, to be formulated thus: 'The memory is weakened by old age, and men are thus incapacitated for active life'. The objection is strictly germane. Cato had said, in 17–20, 'Old men do their part by *mental*, not by physical power'. The objection is, 'Oh, but, their mental powers are in fact not so good'. Cato's answer is two-fold: (a) 'Granted that this objection is well-founded, the blame attaches to nature or to the individual suffering the loss of memory'. (b) 'It is not well-founded. Given a memory to begin with, and proper care in its maintenance, no one will lose his powers of memory'<sup>7</sup>.

(4) Resumption of the main Argument (2): 23–25 (end of Chapter VII).

With 23 we return to 21, end: note *igitur*. Many types of men, from Greek philosophers to Roman farmers, might be cited to show that old age does not per se diminish interest in the activities of life or power to engage in those activities<sup>8</sup>: 23–25 (end of Chapter VII).

(5) Digression: 25 A—26 (new paragraph)<sup>9</sup>.

<sup>6</sup>Section 16 should begin sooner, at Ad Appi Claudii senectutem. . . . So should 18, at Non viribus aut velocitate. . . .

<sup>7</sup>Cicero is fond of arguing thus: (a) 'Granted that what you say is so, what of it?' (b) 'It is not so'. He is indifferent about the order in which he uses the two modes of argument. For an example, giving the order b, a, see Cato Maior 4, Obrepere aiunt . . . stultam senectutem. Compare also 27–29; 39–34 with 44A–46; 66A–69.

<sup>8</sup>This portion of the dialogue corresponds pretty closely, in form and contents, to 15 A–16. We are reminded of Lucretius's didactic and professorial way of restating his position, to make his argument strike home.

<sup>9</sup>A new paragraph, 25 A, should be marked at the beginning of Chapter VIII. So also another, 26 A, at Sed videtis ut senectus, now included in 26. —In 10, most of Cato's remarks about himself constitute a real digression. Cf. too 31, 45.

A citation from Statius, in 24, pertinent to the argument, leads to other citations from Statius that have no bearing whatever on the discussion.

(6) Summing up and Enlargement of Position: 26 A.

Old age is active enough, along the lines followed in earlier periods of life. More than that, some old men add fresh activities.

B. Discussion of the Second Complaint, that senectus corpus facit infirmius: 27–38.

(1) What of it<sup>10</sup>? Old age does not feel the need of strength. The thing to do is to use the strength you have: a man's fame, a man's value to the world do not depend on his physique: 27.

(2) An aside, in the treatment of the orator's case, which involves (a) a confession of weakness, (b) a rebuttal by way of offset to the confession: 28. The section is a most reluctant exception to the statement in 27.

(3) The complaint is not well-founded<sup>10</sup>: old age has strength with which to do important and noble things: 29, to *defecerint*.

(4) A return to the position taken in 27: the failure of strength in old age, when it does happen, is due to the excesses of youth: 29, *Etsi ipsa. . . defectio*—end.

(5) 'The complaint is not well-founded'. This is a return to the position taken in (3). Many examples of old men show that there is no evidence that decay of powers inevitably attends old age: 30–34, 31 is a digression, the thought being resumed at 32 (note *Sed redeo ad me*); 33 contains answer to a supposed objection, that is, an instance of *occupatio*, as in 21.

(6) Strength is not required of old age<sup>11</sup>: 34 A.

(7) 35 forestalls the objection, 'Some old men are too weak to accomplish anything' (*occupatio* again). The answer is: 'Such weakness may be due to causes other than old age. It often befalls young men, too'.

(8) Summing Up: 36 (see note 11)—38.

A homily: 'The lesson of what has been said is that we must do our best to preserve our strength. If one does that, all will be well': 38. 38, *Septimus mihi* to the end, contains proof also from Cato's own experience of the truth of this declaration<sup>12</sup>. For such a homily compare 70.

<sup>10</sup>For the form of the argument see note 7.

<sup>11</sup>A new Section, 34 A, should be marked at the beginning of Chapter XI. So 36 should begin sooner, at *Resistendum*, etc.

<sup>12</sup>The words *easque tuor animi, non corporis viribus*, etc., to the end of 38 carry us back to 27, and even more clearly to 17–20; compare note 3.

C. Discussion of the Third Complaint, that senectus privat omnibus fere voluptatibus: 39-66.

(1) 'What of it? By pleasure in this complaint men generally mean sensual pleasure. If old age removes this, blessed be the name of old age'<sup>13</sup>: 39-44<sup>14</sup>.

(2) The complaint is not well-founded<sup>15</sup>: old age has pleasures.

(a) of feasts, of the right sort, to be sure. Witness Duellius's case, witness my own: 44 A -46.

In 47-48 Cato turns aside to meet an objection (*occupatio* again): 'Granted that old men have pleasure in such matters, that pleasure is not so intense as it once was'. The answer is: (1) 'If that is true, there is not the same yearning for pleasure that there once was; such things are not worth enjoying': 47-48. (2) 'Granted that they are, old age has them in sufficiency'. See 48, latter part.

(b) intellectual: 49-50.

(c) of agriculture: 51-60, to interfuerunt.

It may be noted that 60, to interfuerunt, sums up the discussion, and carries the thought back to 51.

(d) those that come from the influence and respect which a man gets by virtue of his life and character: 60 A -61<sup>16</sup>.

(3) General remarks, 62-64, with summary, especially in quae sunt igitur, etc., 64.

(4) Objection forestalled (*occupatio* again). 'Some old men surely have no *voluptas*: they are so cross, so peevish, so difficult'. 'Here again the trouble is not with old age, but with old men': 65-66, to the end of Chapter XVIII<sup>16</sup>.

D. Discussion of the Fourth Complaint, that haud procul abest senectus a morte: 66-84.

(1) 'What of it? Death is not an evil': 66 A -67<sup>17</sup>.

(2) 'The complaint is not well-founded. Death is as close to young as to old: in fact, it is nearer to them than to the old. In a word, death is always near, to every one': 67 A -69<sup>18</sup>.

(3) Digression, an appeal based on 67 A -69. Cato declares that after all the thing to be desired is not the living long but the living well: 70. Compare the homily in 36.

(4) Death is natural for the old; therefore it is a good, a blessing: 71-74. 72-74 carry the thought in part to a point lying outside the discussion proper, that death comes best when it comes as nature wills. Then comes another homily (compare 36, 70): we must not crave life too earnestly nor leave it voluntarily.

(5) Unlearned men look with composure on death: why should not cultured men attain the same unconcern? 75.

(6) Old age brings satiety of life, and this in turn brings contentment and resignation (i.e. a willingness to die, so that the call of death is no hardship): 76.

(7) Death leads to immortality: 77-84.

The detailed analysis of these sections is as follows:

(a) Declaration that the soul is immortal: 77.

(b) Proofs in support of this declaration: 78-84.

(1) Pythagoras's doctrine: 78, to animos delibatos habereamus.

(2) Plato's arguments: 78 A<sup>19</sup>.

(a) The soul's capacity: cum tanta celeritas . . . mortalem;

(β) The soul's self-activity (self-motion): cumque semper agitur . . . relicturus;

(γ) The soul's indivisibility: et cum simplex . . . interire;

(δ) The soul's prenatal existence: magnoque esse argumento to end.

(3) Xenophon's arguments: 79-81.

(a) The invisibility of the soul after death is no proof that the soul is dead: it is invisible while the body lives: 79.

(β) We remember the 'dead', because their souls are now living, working on our souls, making us remember them; 80, to memoriam sui teneremus.

(γ) If the soul has life and consciousness when hampered by the body, much more does it live when freed by 'death' from the body: 80, mihi quidem numquam . . . sapientem.

(δ) There is no visible evidence that the soul dies: 80, Atque etiam . . . apparet.

(ε) Death is the twin of sleep. Hence, since in sleep the soul is most active, most alive, in 'death' the soul will be thoroughly alive: 81, to relaxaverint<sup>20</sup>.

(5) Summary: 81, quare to end.

(4) Men do great deeds only in consequence of their belief in the immortality of the soul: 82.

(5) Immortality answers the needs of the soul: 83-84.

E. Conclusion: 85.

(1) Old age is easy enough to bear, in itself; more than that, it is delightful, because it lies so close to the true life, the life after 'death': 85, to *volo*.

(2) Even if the soul is not immortal, old age, since it is after the order of nature, cannot be an evil: 85, sin mortuus to end.

C. K.

## THE DIRECT METHOD AND ITS APPLICATION TO THE CLASSICAL LANGUAGES

I accept gladly the invitation of the Managing Editor of THE CLASSICAL WEEKLY to write upon the Direct Method and its application to the teaching of the Greek and Latin Classics. As a classical scholar, indeed, I share the ignorance of the average College graduate. Yet, having had a long experience

<sup>13</sup>Compare note 7.  
<sup>14</sup>44 should stop at insomniis. A new section, 44 A, should be marked at Sed si aliquid dandum est, etc.

<sup>15</sup>A new section, 60 A, should be marked at Ita quantum spatium . . .

<sup>16</sup>A new section, 66 A, should be marked at the beginning of Chapter XIX.

<sup>17</sup>For the form of the argument see note 7.

<sup>18</sup>A new section, 67 A, should begin at Quamquam quis . . . So section 70 should begin one line sooner, at quod cuique, etc.

<sup>19</sup>A new section, 78 A, should be marked at Demonstrabantur, etc.

<sup>20</sup>Section 81 should begin one line sooner, at iam videtis.